THE HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON 8 AT SEATTLE 9 MICROSOFT CORPORATION, Case No. C10-1823-JLR 10 Plaintiff, [PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING VS. 11 **DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO** MOTOROLA, INC., et al., EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY 12 OF TODD MENENBERG 13 Defendants. **NOTED FOR:** 14 MOTOROLA MOBILITY LLC, et al., Friday, July 31, 2013 at 10:00 AM 15 Plaintiffs, 16 VS. 17 MICROSOFT CORPORATION, 18 Defendants. 19 THIS MATTER comes before the Court on Defendants' Motion to Exclude and Strike 20 Testimony of Todd Menenberg. The Court has considered the pleadings filed and therefore 21 deems itself fully advised. Based on the pleadings submitted, 22 IT IS ORDERED THAT: 23 Defendants' Motion to Exclude and Strike Testimony of Todd Menenberg is DENIED. 24

[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY OF TODD MENENBERG - 1

25

1	DATED this 12th day of July, 2013.
2	
3	HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART
4	
5	Presented by: CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
6	By <u>s/Arthur W. Harrigan, Jr.</u>
7	Arthur W. Harrigan, Jr., WSBA #1751
8	By s/Christopher Wion
	Christopher Wion, WSBA #33207
9	Bys/Shane P. Cramer
10	Shane P. Cramer, WSBA #35099
11	999 Third Avenue, Suite 4400
11	Seattle, WA 98104 Phone: 206-623-1700
12	arthurh@calfoharrigan.com
13	chrisw@calfoharrigan.com
13	shanec@calfoharrigan.com
14	
15	By s/T. Andrew Culbert
16	T. Andrew Culbert
	By <u>s/David E. Killough</u>
17	David E. Killough
18	MICROSOFT CORPORATION
19	1 Microsoft Way
•	Redmond, WA 98052 Phone: 425-882-8080
20	Fax: 425-869-1327
21	
22	David T. Pritikin Richard A. Cederoth
22	Constantine L. Trela, Jr.
23	William H. Baumgartner, Jr.
24	Ellen S. Robbins Douglas I. Lewis
25	Douglas I. Lewis

[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY OF TODD MENENBERG - 2

## 

1	David C. Giardina John W. McBride
2	Nathaniel C. Love
3	
4	SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP One South Dearborn
5	Chicago, IL 60603 Phone: 312-853-7000
	Fax: 312-853-7036
6 7	Carter G. Phillips Brian R. Nester
8	SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
9	1501 K Street NW Washington, DC 20005
10	Telephone: 202-736-8000 Fax: 202-736-8711
11	
12	Counsel for Microsoft Corp.
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY OF TODD MENENBERG - 3

25

1	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
1	I, Florine Fujita, swear under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of
2	Washington to the following:
3	1. I am over the age of 21 and not a party to this action.
4	2. On the 12th day of July, 2013, I caused the preceding document to be served on
5	counsel of record in the following manner:
6	Attorneys for Motorola Solutions, Inc., and Motorola Mobility, Inc.:
7	
8	Ralph Palumbo, WSBA #04751 Philip S. McCune, WSBA #21081 Messenger
9	Lynn M. Engel, WSBA #21934 US Mail Summit Law Group Facsimile
10	315 Fifth Ave. South, Suite 1000 <u>X</u> ECF
11	Seattle, WA 98104-2682 Telephone: 206-676-7000
12	Email: Summit1823@summitlaw.com
13	Steven Pepe ( <i>pro hac vice</i> ) Messenger
14	Jesse J. Jenner (pro hac vice) US Mail
15	Ropes & Gray LLP Facsimile 1211 Avenue of the Americas X ECF
16	New York, NY 10036-8704 Telephone: (212) 596-9046
17	Email: <u>steven.pepe@ropesgray.com</u> Email: <u>jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com</u>
18	
19	Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Messenger Ropes & Gray LLP US Mail
20	1900 University Avenue, 6 <sup>th</sup> Floor Facsimile East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284  X ECF
21	Telephone: (650) 617-4030
22	Email: norman.beamer@ropesgray.com
23	
24	
25	

[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY OF TODD MENENBERG - 4

## 

Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Messenger Ropes & Gray LLP US Mail
One Metro Center Facsimile
700 12 <sup>th</sup> Street NW, Suite 900 X ECF
Washington, DC 20005-3948
Telephone: (202) 508-4693
Email: Paul.schoenhard@ropesgray.com
Andrea Pallios Roberts (pro hac vice) Messenger
Brian C. Cannon (pro hac vice) US Mail
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP Facsimile
555 Twin Dolphin Drive, 5th Floor X ECF
Redwood Shores, CA 94065
Telephone: (650) 801-5000
Email: andreaproberts@quinnemanuel.com
Email: briancannon@quinnemanuel.com
Kathleen M. Sullivan (pro hac vice) Messenger
David Elihu (pro hac vice)  US Mail
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP Facsimile
51 Madison Ave., 22 <sup>nd</sup> Floor X ECF
New York, NY 10010
Telephone: (212) 849-7000
Email: kathleensullivan@quinnemanuel.com
William Price (pro hac vice) Messenger
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP US Mail
865 S. Figuera St., 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Facsimile
Los Angeles, CA 90017 X ECF
Telephone: (212) 443-3000
Email: williamprice@quinnemanuel.com
MicrosoftvMotoBreachofRANDCase@quinnemanuel.com
DATED this 12th day of July, 2013.
s/ Florine Fujita FLORINE FUJITA

[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE AND STRIKE TESTIMONY OF TODD MENENBERG - 5

25